

#### Land Tax and Valuation System – Case Study of Namibia

1

#### Presentation for the Second National Land Conference From 01<sup>st</sup> to 5<sup>th</sup> October 2018

#### Safari Hotel, in Windhoek, Namibia.

Protasius Thomas : Deputy Valuer General Ministry of Land Reform Republic of Namibia

By:

# **Presentation Outline**

- 1. Rational background to the presentation
- 2. Land Tax on Commercial Agricultural Land
- 3. Challenges to the implementation of land Tax
- 3. Bases of valuation/Valuation Systems in Namibia for Commercial Agricultural land Acquisition





#### Background

The Namibian Government convened the first National Conference on Land Reform and the Land Question on 24 June – 01 July 1991 [known as "The Land Conference of July 1991"];

Total of Twenty Four (24) main Resolutions were taken

Resolution No. 7 related to imposition of land tax 'Conference resolves that there should be a land tax on commercial farmland'

# Composition of Communal, Freehold & State Land



### **Objectives of Land Tax**

- 1) Encourage efficient use of commercial agricultural land;
- 2) Raise revenue to support land reform that encourages redistribution and development of commercial land;
- 3) Discourage multiple ownership of farms(through the application of a progressive rate of tax);
- 4) Encourage redistribution/diversification of ownership
- 5) Reduce land prices and thus broaden the access to ownership;
- 6) Redress the skewed pattern of land ownership
- 7) Relieve poverty through resettlement and encourage decongestion of communal areas.

6



#### The Legal Framework

No land policies related to land tax on commercial agricultural land existed before the establishment of MLR at independence in 1990.

The below policy documents/ legislation were thus formulated/enacted relevant to valuation and taxation of agricultural land:

The Constitution: Article 16, Article 23, Article 53

Agricultural (Commercial) Land Reform Act No. 6 of 1995

Land valuation and taxation Regulations, 2002

Land valuation and taxation Regulations, 2007

Property Valuers Profession Act of 2012, Act No.7 of 2012

7



#### Agricultural Commercial Land Reform Act No. 6 of

- 1995
- Section 76 empowers the Minister of Lands to impose land Tax on freehold agricultural (commercial) land outside local authority areas.
  - Rate of Land Tax Criteria.
    - Progressive Rate of Land Tax
      - Previous: 0.75% Namibian, 1.75% Foreign
      - Current: 0.4% Namibian, 1.4% Foreign
      - Escalation: 0.25% per additional farmland parcel owned ranked in order of value.
- Concurrence: MoF & MAWF.
- National Assembly Approval.

G	OVERNMENT GAZET	ТЕ
-	OF THE	
R	REPUBLIC OF NAMIB	A
N\$2.00	WINDHOEK - 23 December 2003	No.3110
	CONTENTS	
		Pag
GOVERNMENT	FNOTICE	
	ulgation of Agricultural (Commercial) Land Reform Second Amendi 003 (Act No. 19 of 2003), of the Parliament	
	<b>Government Notice</b>	
	Government Notice	
No. 261		200
No. 261		200
The following.	OFFICE OF THE PRIME MINISTER	d by the Presider
The following in terms of the Constitution.	OFFICE OF THE PRIME MINISTER PROMULGATION OF ACT OF PARLIAMENT Act which has been passed by the Parliament and signed	d by the Presider Article 56 of the



#### Land Valuation and Taxation Regulations

- Section 77 of Agricultural Commercial Land Reform Act, empowers the Minister of Lands to make regulations for land Tax.
- The regulations operationalized the implementation of land tax:
  - 2002, 1<sup>st</sup> Valuation roll prepared; operationalized in 2004/5.
  - 2007, 2<sup>nd</sup> Valuation roll prepared; operationalized in 2008/9.
  - 2012, 3<sup>rd</sup> Valuation roll prepared, operationalization affected by court applications.

<b>БОVERNMENT GAZETTE</b> оf the						
	<b>REPUBLIC OF NA</b>	MIBIA				
N\$6.00	WINDHOEK - 3 July 2007	No. 3870				
	CONTENTS					
GOVERNMEN	T NOTICE	Page				
	d Valuation and Taxation Regulations: Agricultural 1995	(Commercial) Land Reform 1				
	Government Noti	ice				
	MINISTRY OF LANDS AND RESE	TTLEMENT				
No. 120		2007				
AG	LAND VALUATION AND TAXATION F RICULTURAL (COMMERCIAL) LAND					
for agricultur	of Lands and Resettlement, with the concurr e, and the Minister responsible for finan he Agricultural (Commercial) Land Reform	ce, under section 76 read with				
(a) made t	the regulations set out in the Schedule; and	l .				
(b) repealed the Land Valuation and Taxation Regulations published under Government Notice No. 259 of 29 December 2001 and its amendments published under Government Notice No. 128 of 01 June 2004.						
J. EKANDJ MINISTER O	O JF LANDS AND RESETTLEMENT	Windhoek, 18 June 2007				

# Key Drivers Of Land Tax Implementation

- Functioning cadastral system (LIS)
- Functioning deeds registry system (CDRS)
- Carrying Capacity & AEZ information
- Computer Aided Mass Appraisal System (CAMA)
- Land Tax Payment & Reconciliation System (LPTRS)



#### Map of Commercial farms in Namibia



# Number of Rateable Agric. Land Parcels by Region, Size & Unimproved Site Value

	Carl	-	6
ß	P	3	2
1	1	Ì	ú

Region	No. of Farms	Expressed as %age of Grand Total No. of Farms i.e. 12,313	Extent (Ha)		Unimproved Site Value (2012-2017)	Expressed as %age of the Grand Total Unimproved Site Value (2012-2017)
Region	1-211115	1°a11115 1.C. 12,313	Extent (11a.)	<b>J9,058,990(IIA)</b>	(2012-2017)	value (2012-2017)
OSHIKOTO	88	1%	398,963	1%	243,090,000	1.38%
KUNENE	691	6%	2,900,831	7%	1,422,852,400	8.06%
ERONGO	694	6%	2,591,954	7%	1,093,902,100	6.19%
			_,_,_,_,		_,,_,	
KHOMAS	1,010	8%	2,486,902	6%	1,380,905,600	7.82%
OMAHAKE	1,166	9%	4,486,387	11%	3,020,504,700	17.10%
//KARAS	1,674	14%	10,305,270	26%	2,482,345,400	14.05%
OTJOZONDJUPA	2,309	19%	6,673,892	17%	4,424,838,180	25.05%
HARDAP	4,681	38%	9,814,798	25%	3,594,325,700	20.35%
Grand Total	12,313		39,658,996	100.00%		





#### **Agro Ecological Zones Map**

iyers	
towns1	
862	Katima Mul
aez	KADA KADA KALAA X KALA
all other values>	A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A
AEZ_NAME	Charles Othering
CPL1 Central Plateau, Southern Omatako Plain	VALO
CPL10 Central Plateau, flat plains on Karoo rocks with pans and dunes	ALSO E
CPL11 Central Plateau, hill-footslope associations on Karoo rocks	Provide a state of the state of
CPL12 Central Plateau, hills of the Orange River Valley	KAUS KALS
CPL13 Central Plateau, strongly dissected tablelands on Karoo rocks	the the test of test o
CPL14-3 Central Plateau, table mountains on Karoo rocks, average growing period 61-90 days	KALK4 CPLT62 Scrootiontell
CPL14-9 Central Plateau, table mountains on Karoo rocks, average growing period 11-20 days	KALT KALT
CPL15 Central Plateau, plains on metamorphic rocks with dune fields	DANI CPLIE.6 CHIG CPLIE.3
CPL16-2 Central Plateau, red Kalkveld, average growing period 91-120 days	Revenue Privary rol 142
CPL16-3 Central Plateau, red Kalkveld, average growing period 61-90 days	DAMO
CPL16-6 Central Plateau, red Kalkveld, average growing period 31-60 days	0134 8
CPL2 Central Plateau, fringe plains	KA34
CPL3-4 Central Plateau, strongly dissected inselberg plains, average growing period 61-90 days, very short dependable growing pe	KAL34 40
CPL3-6 Central Plateau, strongly dissected inselberg plains, average growing period 41-60 days	CPL2
CPL3-7 Central Plateau, strongly dissected inselberg plains, average growing period 21-40 days	Farihith 10 Ofarihindja
CPL3-9 Central Plateau, strongly dissected inselberg plains, average growing period <10-20 days	Henties Bay
CPL4-8 Central Plateau, strongly dissected plains on Karoo rocks, average growing period 21-30 days	NAM6 Aran di
CPL4-9 Central Plateau, strongly dissected plains on Karoo rocks, average growing period 11-20 days	Swake mand cpt 3.9
CPL5 Central Plateau, flat plains on metamorphic rocks	Walve Bay ESS 5
CPL6 Central Plateau, flat plains on Karoo sedimentary rocks	
CPL7 Central Plateau, flat plains with dolerite outcrops and pans	ESCA Relie beg
CPL8 Central Plateau, rolling hills of the Kalkrand	G, KAL2.7
CPL9 Central Plateau, flat plains of the Kalkrand with sand drift	
DAM1 Damaraland basalt table mountains	
DAM2 Damaraland hill/footslope associations	KAL28
DAM3 Damaraland lowland hills	NAM3 NAM1 CPL4.8 CPL6
ESC1 Escarpment, high table mountains on Karoo rocks	NAM3 NAM1 CPL48 Marintal
ESC2 Escarpment, high mountains on Basement Complex rocks	ESCO
ESC3 Escarpment, high plateaux on Karoo rocks	
ESC4 Escarpment, high plateaux on Basement Complex rocks	Z CPLS TO
ESC5 Escarpment, strongly dissected uplands bordering the highlands	
ESC6 Escarpment, inselberg and pedment plains with stony/sandy cover	
ETO Ekuma Plains and Etosha Pan	
GOR River canyons	Ludents CPL4-9 CPL7
KAL1 Kalahari Sands Plateau, stabilized W-E dunes with few pans KAL10 Kalahari Sands Plateau, Tsumkwe Panveld	Bethanie Keetmansheep
KAL10 Kalahari Sands Plateau, Ana hills and Kalkveld	NAME AND A REAL PROVIDENT
	2 ESCI (P114) 5
KAL2-8 Kalahari Sands Plateau, stabilized NW-SE dunes with common pans, average growing period 21-30 days KAL2-9 Kalahari Sands Plateau, stabilized NW-SE dunes with common pans, average growing period 11-20 days	ALL ALL ALL
	cor harathur
KAL3-1 Kalahari Sands Plateau, stabilized sand drift with few pans, average and dependable growing period exceeds120 days KAL3-2 Kalahari Sands Plateau, stabilized sand drift with few pans, average growing period 91-120 days	
KAL3-2 Kalahari Sands Plateau, stabilized sand drift with few pans, average growing period 91-120 days KAL3-3 Kalahari Sands Plateau, stabilized sand drift with few pans, average growing period 61-90 days, dependable growing 60 %	CRUIL AND
Natarian Janus Hatedu, stabilized sand drift with rew bans, average drowing bend of the days, debendable drowing but %	



#### **Sources of Farm Prices Evidence**

- Primary sources of commercial farm price evidence are:
  - the Deeds Registries in Windhoek and Rehoboth.
- Secondary sources:
  - Estate Agents.
  - Banks.
  - Other.





#### Functioning deeds registry system



Dating back from German colonial era as far back as the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> Century (1895).





#### **Computer Systems**

- Developing computerized systems for tax assessment, such as Computer Aided Mass Appraisal System (CAMA) is vital for effective and efficient rating valuation purpose.
  - CAMA is meant for MLR to migrate from manual preparation of valuation rolls to computer based preparations of the rolls;
  - MLR with the assistance from EU invested N\$4 million in the development of this system.
- Land Tax Payment & Reconciliation System (LPTRS)
  - Developing computerized systems for tax revenue collection and verification, is vital for implementing a land tax efficiently.



#### Land Tax Collection 2004/5 -2017/18

 Cumulative collection by 31 March 2018 – end of financial year (to the nearest cent)

• N\$ 350,043,854.40.

#### Or

• An overall average of

#### • N\$25,003,132.46

per year (over 14 years)

Actual Land Tax Collection Average over the Period

About 62-66%



# Land Tax Collection 2004/5 - 2017/18...collection landscape

Land Tax FY	Average No. Assessments issued per Year	Average value of the Land Tax Assessments (N\$) per Year.	Average value of Actual Land Tax Collected per Year	Value of Land Tax Collected as a %age of Value of Land Tax Assessments (N\$)	Valuation Roll
2004/5	-	-	3,689,351.18	<ul><li>1<sup>st</sup> implementation,</li><li>teething issues</li></ul>	2002-2007
2005/6-2007/8	8,264	33,695,909	26,955,866.00	80%	2002-2007
2008/9 - 2011/12	8,509	46,891,984	37,587,217.00	80%	2007-2012
2012/13	8,292	46,052,314	22,307,003.29	48% Drought year	2007-2012
2013/14 - 2015/16	8,145	44,134,254	19,858,453.00	45% Refunds for Drought year	2007-2012
2016/17	7,208	80,000,000	20,828,627.00	23% Court Challenge	2012-2017
2017/18	100	80,000,000	12,427,047.00	100% Court Interdict	2012-2017

### Land Tax Collection 2004/5 -2017/18...collection landscape.....continued

- 2004/5; 1<sup>st</sup> year of implementation of collection of land tax.
  - Budgeted for collection: N\$18 million.

- Just over **N\$3.6** Million was collected due to a number of legal and administrative teething issues which still had to be overcome and finalized.
- 2005/6 2007/8; an average of nearly 30 million collected each year.
- 2008/9 2011/12; collections increased to nearly N\$ 40 million per year;
- 2012/13: Drought year, Government declared a state of emergency.
  All farmers granted a 100% land tax relief.

### Land Tax Collection 2004/5 -2017/18

- 2013/14 2016/17, dip in land tax collection due to:
  - 2012 valuation roll prepared (high increase in land values), implementation of land tax contested all the way to the Supreme Court as to its constitutionality (matter only disposed of in the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter on 2018).
  - Approval of the 2012 roll by Valuation Court also subjected to review in the High Court (matter still pending).
  - Collection of land on the basis of the 2012 roll interdicted until the finalization of the review case, except for those landowners who out of their own free will chose to pay the tax in order to transact their properties.
    - In this regard, over N\$ 12.4 million, collected based on the 2012 valuation roll.
- 2017/2018 onwards: issuance of Land Tax Assessments withheld pending finalization of the High Court case to review the decision of the Valuation Court.
  - Review date set for May 2019.



#### Land Tax Exemption

 Article 23 of the Namibian Constitution, Articles under which a state of emergency may be declared;

- Section 76B of the Agricultural (Commercial) Land reform Act;
  - 2012/13: 100% drought-related exemption granted to all farmers;
  - Normal exemption, all the years: an average of N\$3.5 million exempted per year;
    - This exemption is not automatic but is on application to the Minister within a prescript period.



#### Achievements

- Basis of Land Tax established through legislation (Agricultural Commercial Land Reform Act, Act 6 of 1995 and Land Valuation and Taxation Regulations of 2007.
- Establishment of Directorate of Valuation and Estate Management.
- Cumulative collection of land tax since 2005 is N\$ 350,043,854.40 million
- Training of Valuers at the Namibian University of Science and Technology institutionalized, Namibians now able to undertake international standard valuations.
- Enactment of Property Valuers Profession Act, Act No. 7 of 2012
- Draft National Valuation Standards developed, pending launching
- Continuous Constitutional and legal challenges resolved.
- Rating Valuation costs money, but land tax is self-sustaining.



# Challenges

- Legal challenges to the approval process Valuation Rolls:
  - E.g. Basis of valuation: Productivity Value or Market Value (willing seller, willing buyer)
  - 2012 2017 Valuation Roll
- Lack of up to date data and at times outdated information for land tax implementation:
  - E.g. CC & AEZ not owned by MLR but by MAWF



### **Conclusion on land Tax**

- Land Tax implementation has been declared legal and constitutional by the Supreme Court in its Judgment in July 2018
- Namibia is the only country that has successfully implemented land tax on commercial agricultural land on the African Continent if not in the world.
- Cumulative contribution since 2005 to land acquisition and development fund as at March 2018 is N\$ 350,043,854.40.



# 2. Valuation Systems in Namibia for Commercial Agricultural land Acquisition

- Guided by provisions in the Constitution, Legislation & International valuation best practices.
- Article 16 Property

0

- Private property rights, ownership by foreign nationals may be prohibited or regulated by legislation.
- Expropriation of property in the public interest subject to the payment of just compensation, in accordance with requirements and procedures determined by Act of Parliament – ACLRA, in this case.
- PART IV of ACLRA Section 20.
  - Willing seller, willing buyer.
  - Expropriation

### 2. Valuation Systems in Namibia for Commercial Agricultural land Acquisition continued.....

- PART IV OF ACLRA, SECTION 25.
- Basis on which compensation is to be determined Aggregate of:
  - Market Value at the date of notice (*willing seller, willing buyer principle*)
  - An amount to compensate for any actual financial loss caused by the expropriation;
  - where the property expropriated is a right, an amount to compensate any actual financial loss caused by the expropriation of the right.
  - On the recommendation of the Commission (as appropriate), add to the total amount payable in accordance with preceding bullets an amount equal to 10 per cent of such total amount, but not more than N\$10 000.
  - Interest at the standard interest rate determined in terms of section 35(a) of the State Finance Act, 1991 (Act 31 of 1991).



#### **International Valuation Guidance**

Namibia Government (through MLR) is affiliated to/member of:

- International Valuation Standard Council (IVSC);
- African Real Estate Society.
- MLR subscribes to the two bodies code of good practice in terms of valuations.
- Some staff members subscribe to the RICS



# **International Valuation Guidance**

- Namibia Government (through MLR) is affiliated to/member of:
  - International Valuation Standard Council (IVSC) standards adapted to Namibia;
- MLR subscribes to the body code good practice in terms of valuations but staff members need to subscribe these bodies in their own capacities.





GOVERNMENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF NAMIBIA

Namibian Valuation Standards 1st Edition 2016



# Valuation Approaches

- Valuation approach general definition:
  - methodology used to determine the market value of a piece of real estate.
- Five common valuation approaches in practice (in Commonwealth countries) are:
  - The Sales/Direct Comparison Approach
  - The Income or Investment Approach
  - The Profits or Accountants' Approach
  - The Cost Approach
  - Residual Approach



# The Sales/Direct Comparison Approach

- Uses market sales price data to estimate the value of real estate property.
  - Directly comparing a property to other similar properties that have been recently sold in the same locality is taken to be indicative of market value.
- Comparable properties, must share certain features with the property in question.
  - E.g. physical features such as square footage, number of rooms, condition, and age of the building)
- Adjustments done for:

- Location e.g. corner plot with a returned street frontage.
- Differences as no two properties are exactly the same.
- Age/Obsolescence, etc.
- MLR uses mainly the sales comparison approach for farm valuations, houses where there are typically many comparables available to analyze

# The Cost Approach

- Model: value of a property = land value (market obtained) + cost of replacing the property (construction costs) minus the physical, economic, functional obsolescence, etc.
  - Land value can be estimated using the sales comparison approach by studying recent sales of land close to the subject property, and these sales should be comparable in size and location.
  - There are different ways to estimate replacement costs:
    - the most common being finding out the cost to build a square foot of comparable properties multiplied by the total square footage of the building.
- Used to value real estate properties that do not easily sell (have no market) like schools, hospitals, museums, libraries, etc.
- This method is also used by MLR both on its own and in combination
  with the Direct Comparison method, as the case may be.

# The Income/Profits Approach

- Used to value rented or income producing properties.
  - E.g. commercial real estate such as offices, retail properties, guest farms, etc.
- In its simplest form, the method takes into account the net income of a property and a return on investment.
- There are two variations of the method:
  - Property Rental approach.
  - Profits or net operating income approach estimated from gross receipts.
  - The property's value is then estimated using a property market related capitalization rate, or <u>cap rate</u>, and net operating income.
- This method is also used by MLR depending on the type of property being valued e.g. game farms or grape farms.

# **Residual Method of Valuation**

- Used to estimate the value of a bare development site or an existing property ripe for redevelopment.
- The model: residual value = Gross Development Value Gross Development Cost, professional fees, etc.
  - The numbers that go behind the equation may be more complex but once these have been determined the residual method of appraisal is a fairly straight forward approach.
- This method is occasionally used by MLR due to the nature of the mandate of MLR



- Each of the Five principal valuation approaches require different detailed methods of application;
- The goal in selecting valuation approaches and methods for an asset is to find the most appropriate method under the particular circumstances;
- No one method is suitable in every possible situation. The selection process should consider, at a minimum, the following:

(a) the appropriate bases of value, determined by the terms and purpose of the valuation assignment. *Sometimes this is by regulation e.g. valuation for land tax*;

(b) the respective strengths and weaknesses of the possible valuation approaches and methods;

(c) the appropriateness of each method in view of the nature of the asset, and the approaches or methods used by participants in the relevant market; and

35



(d) the availability of reliable information needed to apply the method(s).

# Conclusion

- Valuation of Agricultural land for land reform purposes is regulated;
- Government of Namibia as an affiliate member of IVSC is guided by the best practices of this institution in matters of valuation of real property;
- Benchmarking with continental and international community very important if you want to succeed;
- Need for institutional strengthening with requisite levels of competences is required; and
- A dedicated amount of human and financial resources is required.



#### Lessons learned

- A strong political will at high levels is indispensable;
- Strong technical leadership of core staff important;
- The legislation driving the implementation of land tax should be clear, transparent and thorough e.g. whether valuations for land tax is based on 'market value' (willing seller, willing buyer) and which the approach is provided for as per article 16 and ACLRA to purchase farmland;
- Institutions involved in the implementation should have roles that are properly defined and enforceable.



#### Lessons learned

- Implementing agencies should be in place. (MLR);
- If tax is to support a specific programme, there is need to earmark the funds and to establish a specific Fund. (LADF);
- Revenue can support and supplement the funding from Treasury for land reform programmes;
- Land tax has a potential to generate funds for land reform instead of relying on donor funding;



# ....and I thank

# You

